

**Manhattan Community Board Six
Full Board Meeting Minutes
Tuesday, June 27, 2017 – 7:00 PM
Japan Society
333 East 47th Street, Auditorium**

Board Chair Rick Eggers called the meeting to order at 7:08 pm. He introduced Secretary Kathy Thompson and District Manager for CB6, Jesús Pérez.

Mr. Perez handed out the updated East River Fifties Alliance (ERFA) resolution that had been voted on in the special Land Use and Waterfront Committee meeting immediately preceding this special Full Board Meeting. Mr. Eggers thanked the Land Use and Waterfront Committee and the entire Board for their participation in special meetings and efforts to prepare a final resolution to address the ERFA proposal in a timely fashion.

The Chair noted changes to the previously distributed agenda: the Chair's Report would follow Announcements and Reports from Other Committees and the District Manager's Report would be after the Chair's report. Mr. Eggers also announced that the Borough President's report will be presented by Ahmed Tigani.

The agenda, as revised, was adopted.

The first roll call was conducted by Secretary Kathy Thompson.

Public Session - Elected Representatives and Agency Reports

Note: Prior to this meeting, representatives of elected officials were notified that time for this special meeting would be at a premium and they need not attend unless they had something to report that was not addressed in the elected official's newsletter.

David Leeds from Congresswoman Carolyn Maloney's office announced that the Congresswoman will be holding a Town Hall on July 6th. For more information please go to: <https://maloney.house.gov/>

Madeline Grunewald from State Senator Liz Krueger's office waived her report. For more information please go to: <http://www.lizkrueger.com/>.

Grace Philips from Council Member Daniel Garodnick's office waived her report. <http://www.garodnick.com/>.

Tricia Ramcharit from Council Member Rosie Mendez's office waived her report. For information please go to: <http://council.nyc.gov/d2/html/members/home.shtml>

Public Session - Members of the Public

Chair Eggers announced public session, explaining the procedure and reminding all speakers to keep to a time limit of three minutes.

James Dingeman of WBAI/Pacific Radio urged all community boards and elected officials to pass a resolution requesting that the Empire State Building Trust enter into meaningful contract negotiations with Pacifica/WBAI non-profit radio stations.

Harold Evans, a resident of the Sutton Place neighborhood spoke of his support for ERFA's zoning text amendment application.

Carol Whitton, a resident of the Sutton Place neighborhood, brought a poster board demonstration showing how out of context the proposed superscraper on East 58th Street will be for the neighborhood if it is built, and asking the board to support the ERFA zoning text amendment application.

Business Session

The May minutes were adopted.

Treasurer's Report

The June Treasurer's Report was given at the regular June 14 Full Board meeting.

Borough President's Report

Ahmed Tigani from Manhattan Borough President Gale Brewer's office thanked all members of the public that had come out to the three public hearings on the zoning text amendment application of ERFA. He noted that the Borough President's resolution will be issued later this week. For more information please go to:

<http://manhattanbp.nyc.gov/html/home/home.shtml>.

Committee Resolutions & Reports

1. Land Use and Waterfront

Chair Sandro Sherrod presented Resolution: East River Fifties Alliance/Sutton Place Zoning Text Amendment Application N170282ZRM. He noted that the Land Use and Waterfront Committee had met at 6 pm this evening to finalize the resolution. The resolution passed unanimously in committee. He thanked committee members Terrence O'Neal, Kathleen Kelly and Jim Collins for their work in drafting the resolution. Mr. Sherrod read out the two 'Resolves' to the public for their information. Board Member Jim Collins called to question, seconded by Board Member Kathy Thompson and others. The resolution passed unanimously. Mr. Sherrod thanked everyone involved in the lengthy discussions, including the committee and board, the elected officials, and members of the community.

1. Land Use & Waterfront – Sandro Sherrod, Chair

a. East River Fifties Alliance/Sutton Place Zoning Text Amendment. Application N170282 ZRM	33	0	0	0
---	-----------	----------	----------	----------

Chair Eggers also thanked the committee and board and called a short recess at 7:33 pm so that any members of the public who were present solely for the ERFA resolution vote could leave if they wished. He reminded all members of the public that they are welcome to remain for the entire meeting.

Mr. Eggers reconvened the meeting at 7:36 pm

2. Budget and Governmental Affairs

Chair Pedro Carrillo presented Resolution: Intro 1176, requiring the Office of Management and Budget (OMB) to provide access to certain budget-related documents in a machine-readable format. He reported that the committee had caucused earlier in the evening and had approved the final language of the resolution unanimously. He noted that the resolution is designed to codify an OMB practice that is already in place. The resolution passed unanimously. Mr. Carrillo reminded all committee chairs to send in their district needs for the district needs statement by the end of the summer.

2. Budget & Governmental Affairs – Pedro Carrillo, Chair

a. Intro 1176, requiring the Office of Management and Budget (“OMB”) to provide access to certain budget-related documents in a machine-readable format	33	0	0	0
---	-----------	----------	----------	----------

3. Announcements and Reports from Other Committees

Transportation Chair Sandra McKee announced that the Transportation Committee will be meeting on July 10th for a presentation regarding a reconfiguration of East 33rd Street between First and Second Avenues. Further details are on the CB6 website.

Chair’s Report

Chair Eggers announced that anyone wishing to run for an officer position should contact the Nominating Committee Chair, Ahsia Badi, by July 14th. He asked that he not be copied on any notification emails, as he is a candidate himself. Mr. Eggers then introduced new board member John Keller, officially welcoming him to the board.

Mr. Eggers presented Board Member Sarah Shamoan with a certificate for her service over the past two years, noting that she is leaving the board to begin her studies at Harvard. He also noted that she was the board’s youngest member at age 16 when she joined.

Finally, Mr. Eggers reported on a homeless shelter planned for 327 East 17th Street, the former Mapplethorpe Residential Treatment Center. The expected occupancy is either August or sometime in the fall. The board office is trying to schedule a meeting with the service provider, BRC. Mr. Eggers is reaching out to neighborhood groups to attend the meeting and have their questions answered. He has learned that the building will house 28 people, those who have declined housing in the past. BRC will offer enriched programming at the site. Mt. Sinai Beth Israel (MSBI) has given a three year lease to BRC, but the contract could be terminated after 18 months at the option of MSBI. There is the possibility that the building will be sold in the future. Mr. Eggers is working with First Vice Chair Claude L. Winfield and Housing, Homeless and Human Rights Acting Chair Raj Nayar in seeking additional information from the Department of Homeless Services and BRC. He also thanked Mr. Nayar for his continued service as Acting Chair of the committee.

District Manager's Report

District Manager Jesus Perez reported that the search for a permanent office space has not been fruitful as of yet. He feels that he may need to work with other city agencies to accomplish the goal of permanent office space. He introduced two new staff members, Sam Carrigan and Cody Osterman.

Chair Eggers asked that the Executive Committee hold the date of July 19th available in case the need arises for an Executive Committee meeting.

There was no other old or new business.

The second roll call was conducted by Secretary Kathy Thompson.

The meeting was adjourned at 7:55 pm.

Minutes submitted by Secretary Kathy Thompson.

Text of Resolutions Passed

1. Land Use and Waterfront

a.) RE: East River Fifties Alliance/Sutton Place Zoning Text Amendments N 170282 ZRM

Whereas, the Department of City Planning has certified the zoning text amendments proposed by the East River Fifties Alliance, Inc. and co-applicants, Manhattan Borough President Brewer, Senator Krueger, and Council Members Kallos and Garodnick, whose senate and city council districts overlay the mostly residential Sutton Place community and referred them to the board under the identifier N 170282 ZRM; and

Whereas, the board held two public hearings, one of which was conducted jointly with the Manhattan Borough President, on the proposed rezoning where the vast majority of the testimony and submitted written comments were in support of the text amendments; and

Whereas, the amendments would change the zoning of certain blocks generally bounded by the East River & FDR Drive to the east, East 59th Street to the north, 100 feet east of First Avenue to the west, and mid-block between East 51st Street and East 52nd Street to the south, herein referred to as “the subject area”, with a Floor Area Ratio (or “FAR”) of 10, to limit the height of buildings in the area to 260 feet, with an inclusionary housing designated area (IHDA) that would provide for an additional 2 FAR residential bonus and a 1 FAR community facility bonus (i.e., 13 FAR) in exchange for 1.6 FAR of affordable housing; and

Whereas, the current R10 zoning of this principally residential area allows for significantly taller buildings than has been within character of this neighborhood and if left unaddressed would otherwise allow for extraordinarily dissonant development, well outside the context of the current aesthetic and character of the Sutton Place community; and

Whereas, affordable housing, both on-site and equitably distributed throughout the city, has been a long-standing district priority for Manhattan Community Board Six; and

Whereas, the proposed text amendments seeks to expand affordable housing bulk for the subject area by 1 FAR beyond the minimum 0.6 FAR that would be permitted by the existing zoning text; and

Whereas, the subject area, while near the Midtown Special District (MSD), is not, in our considered view, a part of the Midtown commercial business district in either character, purpose, or aesthetic definitions and should be considered separate and apart from the business district so that the zoning of the MSD should in no way influence or determine that of the residential subject area; and

Whereas, the height limits for the subject area envisioned in the proposed zoning text amendments (i.e. 210’ on narrow streets and 235’ on wide streets without affordable housing, and 260’ on narrow and wide streets only with participation in IHDA bonus) would be among several height limited areas immediately abutting the MSD; and

Whereas, the Zoning Resolution’s rules allowing tower-on-a-base construction on wide streets in R10 districts would be inappropriate to the character and aesthetic on narrow streets in the subject area; and

Whereas, the Environmental Assessment Statement has reported that eight of the buildings in the subject area exceed the height limit envisioned; two of those outliers are located on wide streets and are largely ameliorated; and

Whereas, such non-compliant heights are, in any event, hardly extraordinary, given the multiple occasions that the city has revised zoning rules because such rezoning tends to occur after communities recognize the need to address the shortcomings of existing zoning framework; now

Therefore, be it resolved, that Manhattan Community Board Six does hereby express its support for the stated purposes and objectives of the zoning text amendments proposed by the East River Fifties Alliance and elected officials representing the area; and

Be it further resolved, that Manhattan Community Board Six requests the City Planning Commission to reconsider any objection to the proposed text change, taking particular note that the Environmental Assessment Statement projects a 130% increase in affordable housing under the proposed action over a no-action alternative.

VOTE: 33 in Favor 0 Opposed 0 Abstention 0 Not Entitled

2. Budget & Governmental Affairs

a.) RE: Intro 1176-2016, requiring the Office of Management and Budget (“OMB”) to provide access to certain budget-related documents in a machine-readable format

Whereas, in service of increasing government transparency, New York City government documents are being made available as “open data,” so that the public can access them, examine them critically, and formulate independent interpretations; and,

Whereas, in 2015, New York City budget documents were made available in portable document format (PDF) on the website of the Office of Management and Budget (OMB), which collates all governmental budget submissions; and,

Whereas, in 2016, OMB agreed to establish a policy to post these budget documents on OMB’s website, the Open Data Portal, and through an application program interface in a machine-readable format that more easily enables vital functions like searching and collating and extracting information; and,

Whereas, rather than relying on good will and departmental policy, which is subject to change without notice, City Council members have proposed Intro 1176-2016, which would codify the existing OMB policy into law beginning with fiscal year 2018; and,

Whereas, the documents that Intro 1176-2016 would require OMB to make fully accessible in the ways described above include:

- the preliminary budget and supporting schedules;
- the executive budget and any supporting schedules;
- the budget message;
- the Council’s alterations to the executive budget and any supporting schedules;
- the adopted budget and any supporting schedules;
- the departmental estimates;
- the statement of proposed direct expenditures in each service district;
- the financial plan and any supporting schedules and supplemental data;
- the draft ten-year capital strategy and the ten-year capital strategy;
- any report on staffing levels;
- the budget function analysis; and,

Whereas, Intro 1176-2016 is currently laid over in the City Council’s Committee on Finance; and,

Whereas, Manhattan Community Board Six (CB6) strongly supports increased governmental transparency and use of “open data”; and,

Whereas, CB6 relies increasingly on the accessibility of these documents to help assemble its annual District Needs and Budget Requests;

Now, therefore, be it resolved, that that Manhattan Community Board Six supports the passage of Intro 1176-2016 by the City Council and that the Mayor sign it into law.

VOTE: 33 in Favor 0 Opposed 0 Abstention 0 Not Entitled

Resolution Votes

Board Member	1A	2A
Amelia Acosta		
Fred Arcaro	Y	Y
Kyle Athayde	Y	Y
Ahsia Badi		
Martin Barrett	Y	Y
Elvy Barroso	Y	Y
Aissata Camara	Y	Y
Pedro Carrillo	Y	Y
Jim Collins	Y	Y
Colleen Curtis	Y	Y
Louise Dankberg	Y	Y
Daniel Devine	Y	Y
Beatrice Disman		
Richard Eggers	Y	Y
Ava Goldman	Y	Y
Andrew Gross		
Adam Hartke	Y	Y
Molly Hollister		
Aaron Humphrey	Y	Y
Ellen Imbimbo	Y	Y
Paige Judge		
Kathleen Kelly	Y	Y
Sandra McKee	Y	Y
Karen Moore	Y	Y
Rajesh Nayar	Y	Y
Terrence O'Neal		
Gary Papush	Y	Y
Joseph Parrish	Y	Y
Keith Powers		
David C. Reed		
Matt Roberts	Y	Y
Gene Santoro		
Frank Scala		
Lawrence Scheyer	Y	Y
Anne Seligman		
Lou Sepersky		

Sarah Shamoon	Y	Y
Sandro Sherrod	Y	Y
Mary Silver	Y	Y
Letty Simon	Y	Y
Susan Steinberg	Y	Y
Kathy Thompson	Y	Y
Mark Thompson	Y	Y
David Tsin		
Karin van der Donk		
Brian Van Nieuwenhoven	Y	Y
Pamila Vassil	Y	Y
Ronnie White		
Claude L. Winfield	Y	Y

Yes	33	33
No	0	0
ABSTAIN	0	0
NOT ENTITLED	0	0

Attendance

	NAME	Sept	Oct	Nov	Dec	Jan'17	Feb	Mar	Apr	May	June	June (Special)
1	Amelia Acosta										P	E
2	Fred Arcaro	P	P	P	E	A	P	P	P	P	A	P
3	Kyle Athayde	P	P	P	P	E	E	P	P	A	A	P
4	Ahsia Badi	P	P	E	P	E	P	P	A	P	P	E
5	Martin Barrett	A	P	P	P	E	E	P	P	A	A	P
6	Elvy Barroso	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P
7	Aissata Camara										P	P
8	Pedro Carrillo	P	P	E	P	P	P	A	P	P	A	P
9	Jim Collins	E	P	E	P	E	P	P	P	P	E	P
10	Colleen Curtis	P	P	A	A	E	P	P	P	P	P	P
11	Louise Dankberg	P	E	E	P	P	A	P	E	P	P	P
12	Daniel Devine	A	P	A	P	P	P	P	A	A	P	P
13	Beatrice Disman	P	P	P	P	A	P	A	P	P	E	E
14	Richard Eggers	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P
15	Ava Goldman										P	P
16	Andrew Gross										A	A
17	Adam Hartke	P	P	P	P	A	P	P	P	P	P	P
18	Molly Hollister	P	P	E	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	A
19	Aaron Humphrey	A	P	P	P	P	A	P	P	P	P	P
20	Ellen Imbimbo	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P
21	Paige Judge	P	P	P	P	P	E	E	P	P	P	A
22	Kathleen Kelly	P	P	P	A	P	P	P	P	P	P	P
23	Sandra McKee	P	P	P	A	P	P	P	P	A	P	P
24	Karen Moore	P	A	P	P	P	P	P	P	A	P	P
25	Rajesh Nayar	P	P	P	A	P	P	P	P	P	P	P
26	Terrence O'Neal	P	P	P	E	P	P	P	A	P	P	A
27	Gary Papush	P	A	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P
28	Joseph Parrish	A	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	A	P
29	Keith Powers	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	A	A
30	David C. Reed	P	P	P	P	P	P	A	P	P	P	A
31	Matthew Roberts	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P
32	Eugene Santoro	E	P	P	P	P	P	E	P	P	P	E
33	Frank Scala	P	P	P	E	P	P	P	P	E	P	A
34	Lawrence Scheyer	P	P	P	P	A	P	P	E	P	P	P
35	Ann Seligman	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	A
36	Lou Sepersky	P	P	P	P	P	E	P	P	P	A	A

37	Sarah Shamoon	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	E	P	P	P
38	Sandro Sherrod	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	E	A	P
39	Mary Silver	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	A	P
40	Letty Simon	E	P	P	P	P	E	P	P	P	P	P
41	Susan Steinberg	E	P	P	P	E	P	P	P	E	P	P
42	Kathy Thompson	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P
43	Mark Thompson	E	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	E	P	P
44	David Tsin	P	P	P	P	A	P	P	A	P	P	A
45	Karin van der Donk										P	A
46	Brian Van Nieuwenhoven	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P
47	Pamela Vassil	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	E	P
48	Ronald White	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	P	E
49	Claude L. Winfield	P	P	P	A	P	E	P	P	P	P	P